Policy Adoption of the Travel Bubble in Increasing Tourism in Bintan Regency, Riau Islands Province

a Chaereyranba Sholeh; b Adhityo Nugraha Barsei; c Alan Nuari; d Firman

a, b, c Faculty of Social and Political Science Maritim Raja Ali Haji University; b National Research and Innovation Agency; c Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy of The Republic of Indonesia

ABSTRACT

Tourism is one of the leading sectors that makes a huge contribution, especially in the Riau Islands. However, with the Covid-19 pandemic, the number of tourists visiting the Riau Islands dropped significantly, so the government needed to innovate by adopting a travel bubble policy. The purpose of this study was to see how the process of adopting the travel bubble policy in reactivation of the economy and tourism in Bintan Regency, especially during the Covid-19 pandemic. The research method used is qualitative with a descriptive approach. The results of this study are from several stages in the policy adoption process, namely the knowledge stage, persuasion stage, decision stage, implementation stage, and confirmation stage of the application of the travel bubble that has not been fully implemented properly and effectively by the government. This study suggests the need for an adoption process in implementing policy innovations, namely the need for knowledge and fast decision-making in the adoption process so that tourism in the Riau Islands is not disturbed by the pandemic. This study has limitations in obtaining data because the travel bubble policy has just been implemented, so further research can continue the policy implementation process.

ABSTRAK

INTRODUCTION

Tourism is one of the leading sectors that contribute significantly to the increase in Gross Domestic Product (GDP) in various countries. Establishment of policies in the tourism sector aimed at improving the country’s economy, such as policies for Super Priority Destinations and Priority Destinations, the Indonesian Calendar of events, and other policies that support the tourism sector. The Covid-19 pandemic has hurt the world economy (Nasution, Erlina, & Muda, 2020). The number of foreign tourist arrivals (tourists) in 2020 fell by 60-80%, causing a shock to 75 million jobs in the world tourism sector and at risk of losing a turnover of more than 2.1 trillion US dollars (Utami & Kafabih, 2021). In 2020, the number of foreign tourist visits to Indonesia reached 4.02 million or decreased by 75.03 percent compared to the number of foreign tourist arrivals in the same period in 2019 which amounted to 16.11 million visits (Badan Pusat Statistik, 2021). In 2021, BPS reported that foreign tourist arrivals had fallen drastically by 61.57%.

Figure 1.
The Development of the Number of Foreign Tourist Visits 2018-2020 (Thousand Visits)

Source: Badan Pusat Statistik (2021)

The tourism sector in Bintan is the leading sector for the Regional Original Revenue (PAD) of Bintan Regency. In the January-November 2018 period, the contribution to the tourism sector of Bintan Regency reached 67.7% with a total of Rp. 139.95 billion. PAD earned in that period reached Rp. 206.62 billion (suarasiber, 2019). This is also supported by data on foreign tourist visits, where according to the Central Bureau of Statistics of Bintan Regency, in January 2019 40,479 foreign tourists vacationed on Bintan Island. This figure continues to increase from year to year where in January 2018 there were only 26,993 foreign tourists, then there was an increase of around 15,000 in the number of visitors. This increase in the number of tourists provides enormous opportunities for the tourism sector and the creative economy on Bintan Island.

However, with the Covid-19 pandemic, Bintan Regency, especially Lagoi, has fallen. At the beginning of April 2020, 11 hotels and 7 other businesses engaged in the Lagoi tourism sector were temporarily closed (batampos.co.id, 2020). Then Bintan regional income automatically experienced a drastic decrease, so in the changes in the 2020 APBD, the Bintan Regency Government tried to project a regional income of Rp. 1,109,701,456,620. After the plenary session, Member of the Bintan Regional House of Representatives (DPRD), Muttaqin Yaser stated that the total regional income in the 2020 APBD amendments for Bintan was reduced compared to the pure APBD, and reached Rp. 214.178 billion (warta rakyat, 2020).
Bintan Island has long been one of the tourist gateways in Indonesia besides Batam. This then makes Bintan Island very potential to develop its tourism sector and is the third largest contributor of income in Indonesia after Bali and Jakarta with a total contribution of 20% in 2018. The foreign exchange for this tourism sector is held by Bali as the largest contributor with a total of 40%, followed by Jakarta with a total of 30%, and the third position from the Riau Islands (Kepri) with a contribution of 20% (Kuntadi, 2019). With this in mind, the Indonesian government has put in a lot of effort to restore the tourism sector in the Riau Islands.

After the first wave of Covid-19 subsided, several countries began to think about how to recover their economy by establishing travel arrangements. The travel bubble will allow countries with high tourism attractiveness to reorganize their tourism industry (Sharun, Saied, Tiwari, & Dhama, 2021). Travel Bubble is considered a solution for inter-regional travel, considering that the pandemic is expected to last (Luo & Lam, 2020). International tourism in Lagoi, Bintan is the largest revenue source in Bintan Regency's Original Revenue. The idea proclaimed in terms of reopening the tourism sector is through the opening of an international travel corridor called the travel bubble (Biro Komunikasi, 2020). Initially, the discussion regarding the opening of the travel bubble was discussed by Indonesia through a zoom meeting with Singapore as the pandemic lasted longer than initially thought (Asian Journeys, 2021). With the slow response from Singapore, the Riau Islands finally opened a travel bubble that allowed a total of 19 countries to enter Lagoi in Bintan and Nongsa in Batam. (Mulyana, 2021). Lagoi as one of the international tourist destinations has persisted during the pandemic despite experiencing heavy losses (Gugus Tugas Covid-19 Kepri, 2021). Lagoi International Tourism Area, Bintan is the largest revenue source in Bintan Regency's Original Revenue.

The implementation of the travel bubble started on January 24, 2022. However, when this policy has been issued, it has not been effectively implemented and no tourists from Singapore entered the Riau Islands. Meanwhile, tourism managers and local governments in Batam and Bintan have expressed their readiness to welcome tourists from Singapore. Therefore, several things indicate the problem of the travel bubble policy in Indonesia, namely first that the travel bubble rules in Indonesia have been issued and opened, but the Singaporean Government has not allowed shipping to Batam and Bintan when the Indonesian government issued a travel bubble policy. Second, there are still policy differences between Indonesia and Singapore, such as the implementation of VTL (Vaccinated Travel Lane) for Indonesian citizens who go to Singapore to get to any area in Singapore, while Indonesia applies a travel bubble for Singaporean tourists who cannot freely travel outside the bubble area. Therefore, this condition does not describe how the process of innovation is well adopted by policymakers.

**Literature Review**

The travel bubble is one form of policy innovation carried out by the government in improving tourism and the regional economy. The concept of innovation is related to novelty or novelty-oriented (Wicaksono, 2018). Previous research conducted by Yu et al., (2021) said that the travel bubble policy between Taiwan and the Republic of Palau in March 2021 was initiated on the precondition that cases between countries were equally controlled. This means, that if one country's cases are not controlled, the travel bubble will be difficult to implement (Yu et al., 2021). The results of this study conclude that the travel bubble in Taiwan is said to be successful because foreign tourists are very concerned about the dangers of transmission, how to prevent protocols, and feel comfortable traveling without worrying about the dangers. (Yu et al., 2021). Then research from Luo & Lam (2020) found that Covid-19 affected travel anxiety, but this
anxiety had little effect on travel intentions. The results of the study also confirm that the Travel bubble is an effective way to restore the Hong Kong economy as a country that depends on tourism (Luo & Lam, 2020). The search used the tourism keyword in the Publish or Perish application from 2020 - 2022. However, one journal was found related to the travel bubble in 2020. The journal research results were published by Bappenas Working Papers (BWP).

**Figure 2.**

**Literature Review Research on the Travel Bubble**

In this study, it was concluded that opening the door to travel with certain countries could revive the engine of the Indonesian economy. However, executing a travel bubble policy is not easy, if you look at the lessons learned from several countries that are planning to open a travel bubble cooperation (Sugihamretha, 2021). A travel bubble is an agreement in which a signatory agrees to open its borders to tourists from a partner economy or economy, it can be used for business travel or includes leisure travel, and access can be reciprocal or one-way established between two or more partners. (Helble & Fink, 2020). In implementing the Travel Bubble in Indonesia, this policy is something new in increasing tourism in Indonesia. Innovation has been the cornerstone of many government programs for administrative and public service reform. For this reason, the level of adoption of innovation in government activities is increasing so that the government’s ability to adopt a policy is needed in all government activities.

In the policy adoption process stage, there are five stages of the process in adopting a policy innovation, namely: Knowledge Stage, Persuasion Stage, Decision Stage, Implementation Stage, and Confirmation Stage.

The knowledge stage begins when a person becomes aware of an innovation and gains some understanding of how the innovation functions. After that, a person forms a favorable or unfavorable attitude towards the innovation which is called the persuasion
stage. When you have accepted the policy innovation that will be used, the next step is the policy decision stage which leads to an election to accept or reject. This decision includes further consideration of whether or not he will try the innovation if the innovation can be tried. After the policy-making stage, the next is the implementation stage, where this stage occurs if, in the previous stage, individuals or participants chose to adopt the innovation. In this stage, the individual will use innovation. If in the previous stages the process that occurred was more of a mental exercise, namely thinking and deciding, in this implementation stage the process that occurs is more towards changing behavior as a form of using the new idea. The last stage is the confirmation stage. The confirmation stage takes place after there is a decision to accept or reject for an indefinite period.

The novelty of this study is analyzing how the policy adoption process was carried out by the government in implementing the travel bubble policy in Bintan Regency. In Indonesia, no research has been found with the keyword "tourism" that discusses the travel bubble in a Google Scholars search. This study has limitations in obtaining data because the travel bubble policy has just been implemented so further research can continue on the policy implementation process.

**RESEARCH METHODS**

In compiling this research, the author uses qualitative research methods with descriptive analysis methods. The qualitative approach was chosen because this study seeks to describe the views, and perceptions of researchers as a whole and seeks to reveal in depth the adoption of the travel bubble policy in Bintan Regency. The author uses a qualitative research method with a descriptive approach because by using a qualitative method, the author can understand more deeply the phenomena that occur in the field. The final result of this study is that researchers can provide suggestions or recommendations about instruments for adopting policy innovations in increasing tourism, where the travel bubble policy is used by the government in reactivating tourism in Bintan Regency. Qualitative research also provides a freer space for researchers to explore information and data in the field. With this approach, the writer can also express the views, attitudes, and experiences of the informants and the values held by the informants. All the information that the author got in the field, both from research informants and documents, was conveyed straightforwardly and sharply so that it could reveal the results of the research in depth.

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS**

Bintan Regency is one part of the Riau Islands Province with its regional income (PAD) which is very dependent on the tourism sector. Lagoi as a well-known tourism area in Bintan Regency is the largest contributor to PAD, considering its international standards. Despite being the object of an international tourism area, based on data in the field, Bintan’s fame abroad is inversely proportional to that at home. This is because domestic tourists have limited access to visit the Bintan area. Flights to and from Tanjungpinang airport, the capital of the Riau Archipelago, in addition to a very minimal frequency, are also only connected to three destinations, namely Jakarta, Pekanbaru, and Batam. Based on tourist bookkeeping data from Bintan, the disparity between local and foreign tourists is very contrasting. In 2019 Bintan Island recorded nearly 1.1 million tourists, with more than 70% of the total carrying passports (Rahadiansyah, 2021). Lagoi’s existence has deteriorated since the entry of Coronavirus Disease (Covid-19) in Indonesia and the international world as a place for foreign tourists in early 2019.
Since the spread of the Covid-19 Pandemic, all sectors, both national and international, have experienced a slump, including the tourism sector. There is an alternative policy, namely the travel bubble policy to solve problems in tourism in the Riau Islands Province, precisely in Bintan Regency and Batam City. In this case, the government adopted a travel bubble policy to be implemented in the Bintan area because it aims to increase the tourism sector again for foreign tourists. The travel bubble concept is a solution to improving the economy of the tourism sector during the pandemic. However, this concept is less effective because of the long quarantine period, even though the second vaccine and booster have been carried out. In addition, they must first quarantine for 14 days and the cost is quite expensive. Then the existence of a PCR process at the place of origin and destination as well as PCR which causes tourists to wait long enough at the port is one of the shortcomings of this policy. Should a travel bubble be present, it can make it easier for tourist visitors to come to Nongsa Batam or Lagoi because later it can increase the tourism sector again even though it is experiencing a pandemic. In this study, the author will discuss how the adoption of policy innovation in implementing the travel bubble in the Riau Islands is based on Rogers’ theory, namely the stages of knowledge, persuasion, decision, implementation, and confirmation.

Knowledge Stage

At this stage, policy implementers must know the policy innovations to be implemented. The travel bubble is a concept that emerged in response to international travel restrictions during the pandemic. In practice, a travel bubble will allow limited travel between countries that agree to it. This is done to accelerate the economic recovery of countries affected by the pandemic. The Travel Bubble is an exclusive partnership between countries that have successfully contained and combated the Covid-19 pandemic, and have agreed to create a travel corridor also known as the "Corona Corridor". This corridor will make it easier for residents who live in it to travel without the following self-quarantine.

This aspect of implementing the travel bubble is interesting to other policies because the area that has been determined for the implementation of the travel bubble has been considered as well as possible. Not only that, the government in adopting this policy, of course, always monitors the movement of foreign tourists who are on vacation in Nongsa Batam and Lagoi. The travel bubble is said to be easy for tourists to understand because the government makes policies, of course, based on ongoing conditions, thus issuing the Covid-19 Task Force Circular Number 3 of 2022 concerning Health Protocols for Overseas Travelers. After the circular was issued, the travel bubble trial was carried out starting January 24, 2022, and started moving in February. Of course, the trial is implemented by the Circular Letter that has been issued and adjusts the new circular if there is an update.

Persuasion Stage

In the case of the travel bubble that Indonesia wants to adopt in the Riau Islands Province, the decision-making process for the adoption of the travel bubble is carried out for a year for stakeholders to pay attention to understanding tests and feasibility tests. This process certainly involves many actors within the Central Government, namely, the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy which acts as the leading sector, the Ministry of Law and Human Rights of the Republic of Indonesia, and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Indonesian National Armed Forces/Police. Meanwhile, the Regional Government (Pemprov Kepri) involves the Riau Islands Provincial Transportation Service, the Riau Islands Provincial Health Office or the Port Health Office, and others as needed. The selection of the Riau Islands Province, especially the Lagoi-
Bintan tourist area as an experimental area for the adoption of the travel bubble, is considered effective because this area is included in the top 3 most tourist visits in Indonesia and has adequate health protocol facilities and infrastructure compared to other tourist areas. So that if the adoption of the travel bubble policy is implemented, it will have an impact on increasing the economy of the country/region and the multiplier effect.

Figure 3. Prospects of Singapore’s Foreign Tourist Market in the Riau Islands

This is certainly welcomed by the Governor of the Riau Islands Province and his staff and seeks to develop safe and effective procedures for foreign tourist travel. However, it should be noted that when this adoption is implemented, it will have an effect or not on the addition of the Covid-19 transmission cluster. So that later it will not be a big loss caused by the adoption of this policy. Seeing the existing considerations, the government decided to adopt the travel bubble concept.

On September 8, 2021, the central government has planned to open a travel bubble for the Riau Islands with Singapore in October 2021 (Iman, 2021). According to the Head of the Riau Islands Tourism Office, Buralimar, the plan to execute the travel bubble is just waiting for the MoU of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. If the travel bubble is officially implemented, foreign tourists will be directly escorted to the designated tourist destinations. Singapore also showed a positive response regarding the travel bubble plan. It is proven by Singapore’s policy on 22 September 2021 which allows all passengers with a history of travel to Indonesia to transit at Changi Airport, before departure to other destinations within the last 21 days. (angka berita, 2021).

It's just that the agreement regarding the travel bubble policy has not been signed by Singapore. The head of the Bintan Tourism Office stated that the travel bubble requires a network of cooperation by the Regional Government of Bintan Regency with PT. Bintan Resort Horizon.

In addition to carrying out various tourism promotions, the Bintan Regency Government has also taken other policies that can support the reactivation of Lagoi as an international standard tourism area. Before raising the travel bubble agreement to the scope of the ministry, the Regional Government of Bintan Regency cooperated with PT. BRC in preparing standards for submission of Lagoi in the travel bubble. The Government of Bintan Regency together with PT. BRC cooperated in the preparation of Lagoi submission standards as a pilot project for cross-country travel corridors. One example of a standard that must be prepared in hotel management
that meets the requirements of the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy program, namely Cleanliness, Health, Safety, and Environment Sustainability (CHSE). The local government of Bintan Regency encourages hotels in Lagoi to obtain CHSE certification.

After the issuance of the CHSE certificate, the success of the vaccination program, and the preparation of the zoning map of the tourism area, the District Government did not necessarily sit back. The local government of Bintan Regency also assisted in the construction of a PCR laboratory in Lagoi. PCR laboratories are urgently needed in dealing with the pandemic situation as a preventive measure to suppress the spread of positive cases of Covid-19. Since the opening of the travel bubble in Bintan-Batam, the Riau Islands Provincial Government has continued to experience various unfavorable conditions. During one month of implementation, the realization of the number of foreign tourists visiting the Riau Islands still tends to be low and does not meet the targeted quota of 350 people/week.

**Decision Stage**

When the Riau Islands were preparing and cleaning up for the implementation of the travel bubble, there was an increase in Covid-19 cases in Singapore on September 17, 2021 (Pristiantaru, 2021). This spike came after Singapore imposed an easing of Covid-19 restrictions. Due to this incident, the Government of Singapore has decided to tighten social restrictions which will last until October 24, 2021, (ulasan.co, 2021). This then thwarted the Riau Islands and Singapore travel bubble that was launched many months ago. Even though the Bintan Regency Government itself has completed various meetings with the Indonesian Ministry, it is just a matter of waiting for the progress of the agreement between the Indonesian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Singapore Ministry. The Governor of the Riau Islands has also held several talks with the Minister of Singapore in the context of progressing the Kepri-Singapore travel bubble.

This can also be seen from the differences in the tourism travel scheme used by Singapore, namely VTL which provides more relief for foreign tourists to travel abroad so that the travel bubble is considered ineffective. Regarding this, the Riau Islands Provincial Government also coordinated with the central government by submitting a letter of application to the Head of BNPB RI, the Minister of Foreign Affairs, and the Minister of Law and Human Rights of the Republic of Indonesia to eliminate several requirements that are considered difficult for foreign tourists to visit the Riau Islands. To respond to some of these obstacles, the Head of BNPB RI issued Circular Letter Number 17 of 2022 concerning Health Protocols for Overseas Travel During the Corona Virus Disease 2019 (Covid-19) Pandemic on April 4, 2022. Since the revision of the regulation, it has been recorded that until May 2022, foreign tourist visits have been recorded. in Bintan reached 5,281 visits. For now, the travel bubble is believed to still be implemented by the Riau Islands Provincial Government by eliminating several requirements that are considered burdensome for foreign tourists.

Having failed in opening the door for foreign tourists with Singapore, the Riau Islands then opened a travel bubble that allowed 19 countries to enter Lagoi in Bintan and Nongsia in Batam. (Mulyana, 2021). The list of 19 countries that are allowed to enter the Riau Islands through this travel bubble is Saudi Arabia, United Arab Emirates, New Zealand, Kuwait, Bahrain, Qatar, China, India, Japan, South Korea, Liechtenstein, Italy, France, Portugal, Spain, Sweden, Poland, Hungary, and Norway. The 19 countries were selected according to the standards of the World Health Organization (World Health Organization) with low recorded cases of Covid-19 transmission. Unfortunately, although the travel bubble has been opened for these 19 countries, until early November 2021 there have been no foreign tourists visiting Bintan Regency.
Implementation Stage

The implementation of the travel bubble in the Riau Islands is regulated in Circular Letter Number 3 of 2022 concerning Health Protocols for Overseas Travelers Mechanism for Travel Bubbles in the Batam, Bintan, and Singapore Areas During the Corona Virus Disease 2019 (Covid-19) Pandemic Period. The purpose of this Circular is to monitor, control, and evaluate the implementation of the tourism travel bubble in the Batam and Bintan areas with Singapore to prevent an increase in the transmission of COVID-19 including the new and future variants of SARS-CoV-2.

The implementation of the travel bubble policy in the Riau Islands certainly has a target in terms of improving the regional economy and increasing the tourism sector during the pandemic. The implementation of the travel bubble policy began in February 2022. In addition, the adoption of the travel bubble policy involved several actors, namely the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy, the Indonesian Ministry of Law and Human Rights, and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs as well as the Indonesian National Armed Forces/POLRI, the Bintan Regency Tourism Office, the Tourism Office Riau Islands Province, the Archipelago Province Transportation Service, the Riau Islands Provinical Health Office and so on. A travel bubble is a travel corridor system that aims to divide participants into different groups (bubbles). This is done by separating participants from tourist destinations or someone who has a risk of being exposed to Covid-19. The following is the zoning made in the lagoi area for the application of travel bubbles:

**Figure 4.**
Zoning of the application of the Travel Bubble area in Bintan Regency

![Zoning Map](PT. Bintan Resorts Cakrawala (2021))

The concept of adopting a travel bubble policy is somewhat better than other policies to be applied in this pandemic condition. The travel bubble policy has a positive impact, one of which is an increase in the economy of business actors, which initially decreased, now increases in the Batam-Bintan-Singapore travel bubble implementation area which was originally empty of visitors. In addition, the social impact of the direct communication process while still complying with health protocols after a long decline in foreign tourism visitors. The factors that support the application of the travel bubble are transportation access, and licensing made easy by the...
government for foreign tourists. The application of the travel bubble cannot be separated from the existence of stakeholders between the government, the private sector, and the community. Therefore, the adoption of the travel bubble is expected to run as expected with various considerations.

In addition, the Singapore Government agreed to open a border lane called the Reciprocal Green Lane (RGL) (Suryakepri, 2020). **Reciprocal Green Lane or Travel Corridor Arrangement (TCA) is a service agreement between Singapore and Indonesia that serves special passengers with important business or business trips.** (PT. Angkasa Pura II, 2020). The percentage of the number of foreign tourist visits is described in the following table and figure:

### Table 1.
**Foreign Tourist Visits by Entrance Period January-November 2019-2021 (Covid-19 Period)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Numb.</th>
<th>Entrance</th>
<th>2019</th>
<th>2020</th>
<th>2021</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Riau Islands</td>
<td>2.864.795</td>
<td>411.248</td>
<td>2.274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Batam City</td>
<td>1.947.943</td>
<td>306.777</td>
<td>2.104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Bintan Regency</td>
<td>634.735</td>
<td>64.234</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Karimun Regency</td>
<td>112.753</td>
<td>21.537</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Tanjungpinang City</td>
<td>169.364</td>
<td>18.700</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Badan Pusat Statistik (2021)

RGL/TCA allows for an ongoing cross-border journey for important business or official purposes between the two countries. RGL and TCA lines are only provided for business trips between two countries, Singapore and Indonesia. It’s just that the existence of this route also does not help the downturn in the tourism sector in Bintan Regency.

**Figure 5.**
**Comparison of Overall Tourist Arrivals in Lagoi for the 2011-2021 Period**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>JAN</th>
<th>FEB</th>
<th>MAR</th>
<th>APR</th>
<th>MAY</th>
<th>JUN</th>
<th>JUL</th>
<th>AUG</th>
<th>SEP</th>
<th>OCT</th>
<th>NOV</th>
<th>DEC</th>
<th>Grand Total</th>
<th>Delta</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>32,095</td>
<td>37,059</td>
<td>39,044</td>
<td>35,238</td>
<td>37,586</td>
<td>46,681</td>
<td>43,448</td>
<td>42,429</td>
<td>37,411</td>
<td>37,151</td>
<td>38,327</td>
<td>47,419</td>
<td>470,470</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>42,597</td>
<td>39,617</td>
<td>38,011</td>
<td>33,759</td>
<td>34,060</td>
<td>46,472</td>
<td>42,349</td>
<td>43,568</td>
<td>40,833</td>
<td>43,431</td>
<td>40,414</td>
<td>46,906</td>
<td>487,675</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>33,961</td>
<td>39,203</td>
<td>46,404</td>
<td>36,203</td>
<td>33,985</td>
<td>42,942</td>
<td>32,047</td>
<td>46,615</td>
<td>32,082</td>
<td>40,981</td>
<td>39,965</td>
<td>45,903</td>
<td>457,579</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>42,540</td>
<td>38,331</td>
<td>38,190</td>
<td>35,278</td>
<td>36,905</td>
<td>44,919</td>
<td>47,947</td>
<td>45,396</td>
<td>34,522</td>
<td>37,266</td>
<td>36,042</td>
<td>41,947</td>
<td>478,457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>55,051</td>
<td>57,605</td>
<td>45,561</td>
<td>41,667</td>
<td>64,144</td>
<td>49,285</td>
<td>88,888</td>
<td>53,634</td>
<td>49,638</td>
<td>45,041</td>
<td>41,273</td>
<td>84,227</td>
<td>676,034</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>85,079</td>
<td>53,854</td>
<td>55,498</td>
<td>60,727</td>
<td>64,342</td>
<td>90,343</td>
<td>63,704</td>
<td>74,249</td>
<td>76,055</td>
<td>60,371</td>
<td>67,156</td>
<td>119,036</td>
<td>698,204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018</td>
<td>72,945</td>
<td>82,831</td>
<td>89,918</td>
<td>78,680</td>
<td>82,442</td>
<td>134,245</td>
<td>93,794</td>
<td>87,053</td>
<td>77,615</td>
<td>68,268</td>
<td>74,216</td>
<td>121,299</td>
<td>1,063,456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2019</td>
<td>73,883</td>
<td>79,753</td>
<td>76,451</td>
<td>85,666</td>
<td>80,458</td>
<td>117,289</td>
<td>102,397</td>
<td>99,627</td>
<td>83,171</td>
<td>82,823</td>
<td>90,662</td>
<td>122,365</td>
<td>1,094,442</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2020</td>
<td>98,780</td>
<td>36,413</td>
<td>18,770</td>
<td>319</td>
<td>947</td>
<td>1,047</td>
<td>2,615</td>
<td>4,050</td>
<td>4,469</td>
<td>9,270</td>
<td>8,156</td>
<td>17,127</td>
<td>292,563</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2021</td>
<td>3,611</td>
<td>5,468</td>
<td>5,742</td>
<td>3,851</td>
<td>7,919</td>
<td>9,711</td>
<td>1,935</td>
<td>1,255</td>
<td>1,255</td>
<td>1,255</td>
<td>1,255</td>
<td>1,255</td>
<td>1,255</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: PT. Bintan Resorts Cakrawala (2021)
Tourist arrivals in 2019 still showed an increase, although lower than the previous years, which was 2.91% with a total number of visits of 1,094,442. However, in 2020, the number of visits will be minus 81.49% with a total number of visits of 202,563. In 2021 (January-August period) it was even worse, tourist visits decreased to minus 78.30% from 2020 with a total number of visits of only 43,953.

Confirmation Stage

The results of the application of the travel bubble in Bintan, resulting in a hypothesis that there was an indication that the government was in a hurry to implement it. Given the highest number of daily cases on February 23, 2022, it was confirmed as many as 585 people/day. While daily cases from February 24 to March 11, 2022, were confirmed as many as 357 people/day which showed a consistent downward trend. This fact became one of the reasons in the first month after the implementation of the travel bubble, tourist areas were not visited by foreign tourists. As mentioned by the Head of Tourism Marketing Development of the Riau Islands Province, the implementation of the travel bubble in the Riau Islands was not rushed but too late. In the end, the requirements given in the travel bubble were considered too difficult if you wanted to target foreign tourists to enter Bintan. Therefore, in implementing the travel bubble in the Riau Islands, it is necessary to have agility in responding to situations and policies so that a policy innovation can be adopted effectively, and tourism trends can be controlled even though there is still a pandemic.

CONCLUSIONS

The tourism sector in Bintan is the leading sector for the Regional Original Revenue (PAD) of Bintan Regency. However, with the Covid-19 pandemic, Bintan Regency Tourism, especially Lagoi, has fallen. The Travel Bubble is considered a travel solution between regions and a novelty in increasing tourism in Indonesia. Therefore, in the application of innovation, namely the travel bubble, the government’s ability to adopt a policy is needed in all government activities. The travel bubble policy has a positive impact, one of which is an increase in the economy of business actors, which initially decreased, now increases in the Batam-Bintan-Singapore travel bubble implementation area which was originally empty of visitors. In adopting a policy innovation, namely the travel bubble, knowledge of policy actors is needed about the innovation to be carried out so that the adopted policy has a positive impact. After having good knowledge of the policies to be taken, persuasion is needed so that policy actors, namely local governments, can choose whether or not to carry out the policies that will be adopted. travel bubble policy is considered too late to be implemented. Therefore, in implementing the travel bubble in the Riau Islands, it is necessary to have agility in responding to situations and policies so that a policy innovation can be adopted effectively, and tourism trends can be controlled even though there is still a pandemic.

REFERENCES


